

## **CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MINUTES**

### **DATE: MARCH 26, 2015**

The City of Cincinnati's Civil Service Commission met in regular session in Room 307, City Hall on Thursday, March 26, 2015. Commissioners in attendance were Mr. James Robinson, Chair, and Mr. C. Freeman McNeal. Commission staff present included, Assistant HR Director, Nancy Olind, Civil Service Recording Secretary, Seeta Martindale, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Darrell Ludlow, and Human Resources Analysts, Ornita Brown, Bruce Ross, Doris Adotey, and Derrick Gentry.

### **AGENDA ITEMS**

#### **COMMISSIONERS' OPENING STATEMENT: Condolences**

**Commission members expressed condolences to the family, friends and colleagues of Daryl Gordon, one of the City's dedicated Fire Fighters who passed away in the line of duty on the morning of March 26, 2015. A moment of silence was observed prior to the commencement of the regular Civil Service Meeting.**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE 3/12/2015 MEETING.** Minutes were previously routed and reviewed. Commissioner McNeal made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Robinson seconded the motion and the minutes were unanimously approved.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE:**

**Autumn Morris to the position of Crime Analyst in the Police Department.** This position was posted as an open-competitive exam. The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for appointment to the classified service through the competitive process. The candidate met the minimum requirements for the position, competed and obtained a passing grade on the exam, met the needs of the department, and was selected from among the candidates referred to the department. The Commission approved this item.

**Larry Thomas, James Foster, Theodore Rivers, and Grady Dalmida to the position of Laborer in the Parks Department.** Commission Staff verified all required criteria for promotion within the guidelines of cited rules. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position and were selected from the Municipal Worker seniority list. The Commission approved this item.

**Andrea Schmerr, Brandon Prather-Young, Jonada McNeal, Allyssa Twehues, Klia O'Neal, Courtney Compton, Tanisha Whitehead, Cari Elam, Jessica McCloud, Lamika Barber, Nikki Claus, Camara Wall, and Richard Randal to the position of Assistant Operator and Dispatcher in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center.** Commission Staff verified all required criteria for promotion within the guidelines of cited rules. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position and were selected from among those referred to the department from the eligible list. The Commission approved this item, pending final authorization from Employee Health Services.

#### **APPOINTMENT TO THE CLASSIFIED SERVICE: Non-Competitive**

**Lori Alford to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from

among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Medical Assistant licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Lesley Barry to the position of Medical Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Medical Assistant licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Kelsey Barnett to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Dental Assistant licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Jodi Smith to the position of Dental Assistant in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Dental Assistant licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Emily Mercer to the position of Dental Hygienist in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Dental Hygienist licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Ebisinde Akah to the position of Dentist in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the specific licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Ryan Baumgartner to the position of Public Health Nurse 2 in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Public Health Nurse 2 licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Juwanda Johnson to the position of Pharmacy Technician in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Pharmacy Technician licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Denise Pattison to the position of Nurse Practitioner in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Nurse Practitioner licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Crystal Riddell to the position of Optometric Technician in the Health Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Optometric Technician licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Stephen Knizner to the position of Florist in the Parks Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Florist licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment pending a background check.

**Garrett Dienno to the position of Florist in the Parks Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the Florist licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition

and approved the appointment pending a background check and final authorization from Employee Health Services.

**Jeff Eilers and Lorri Winchester to the position of Senior Engineer in the Department of Water.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and were selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the licensure requirement and professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved these appointments pending final authorization from Employee Health Services for Ms. Winchester.

**Jamie Accurso to the position of Supervising Architect in the Public Services Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Ann Herzner to the position of Internal Auditor in the Department of Citizen Complaint and Internal Audit.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and experience needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Chad Ford to the position of Technical Systems Analyst in the Department of Water.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and experience needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Chad Bolser to the position of Computer Programmer Analyst in the Police Department.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and licensure needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**Jeffrey Asman to the position of Carpenter in the Department of Water.** The staff provided information in accordance with the rules for the non-competitive appointment process. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, possessed the required skills and experience needed by the department, and was selected from among the qualifying candidates referred to the department. Due to the professional nature of the work, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the appointment.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Promotion**

**Calvin Lockett to the position of Truck Driver in the Parks Department.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Gary Davis, Juan Collier, LaMarr Kelly, and John Benton to the position of Truck Driver in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidates met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, were referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Michael Roth to the position of Civil Engineering Technician 2 in the Department of Water.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the AFSCME Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**Jason Grooms to the position of Plant Supervisor in the Department of Sewers.** This position was posted as a promotional examination. The candidate met the minimum qualifications for the position as outlined in the job posting, was referred to the department and selected within the guidelines of the CODE Collective Bargaining Agreement. The Commission noted this item.

**PROMOTION WITHOUT EXAM**

**Mark Koenig to the position of Plant Operator 2 with the Department of Sewers.** The candidate met the minimum requirements of the position and was selected for promotion based on Civil Service Rule 10 § 9, as he has acquired the pertinent licensure required from the State of Ohio Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). Based on the specific needs of the department, the Commission suspended the requirement for competition and approved the promotion without exam.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Working out of Class Extension**

**Kevin Linn in the position of Information Technology Assistant Manager in the Department of Sewers.** The Department of Sewers provided notice of an extension for Kevin Linn to continue working out of class in the position of Information Technology Assistant Manager. This extension will provide consistency for the department until the incumbent completes his temporary assignment in the position of Information Technology Manager and can return to the Information Technology Assistant Manager position. The department stated that Mr. Linn's experience and current involvement with managing special projects in this role would pose some difficulty with rotating the position at this time. This action is in accordance with the CODE contract. The Commission noted this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: VOLUNTARY DEMOTION**

**Amanda Wiedeman to the position of Emergency 911 Operator in the City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center.** The City Manager's Office/Emergency Communication Center requested that Ms. Wiedeman be permitted to voluntarily demote from the position of Assistant Operator and Dispatcher to the vacant position of Emergency 911 Operator within the division. Ms. Wiedeman signed a voluntary demotion form detailing the

rules of accepting the demotion and noted her acceptance of those rules. All parties were agreeable to the voluntary demotion, and the Commission approved this item.

**NOTICE OF PERSONNEL ACTION: Transfer**

**LaVonne Palmer to the position of Truck Driver in the Public Services Department.** The Department of Public Services provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Truck Driver in the Public Services Department. The candidate was selected based on the AFSCME contract from among the qualified applicants interested as meeting the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Michael Edds to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker II in the Department of Sewers.** The Department of Sewers provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Electrical Maintenance Worker II in the Department of Sewers. The candidate was selected based on the AFSCME contract from among the qualified applicants interested as meeting the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**Kathryn Combs to the position of Customer Relations Representative in the Health Department.** The Department of Public Services provided notice of the transfer of the candidate to the position of Customer Relations Representative in the Health Department. The candidate was selected based on the AFSCME contract from among the qualified applicants interested as meeting the specific skills needed by the department. The Commission noted this item.

**ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request for Approval of Special Examiners**

- a) David Rechel, Thomas Rechel, Peter Knecht, David Hines, and Raymond Grothaus for the Water Customer Service Representative 2 exam
- b) Bridget Bardua, Paul Broxterman, Jeffrey Butler, Jr., Daniel Gerard, Maris Herold, Eliot Isaac, Michael John, Paul Neudigate, Michael Neville, Russell Neville, Teresa Theetge, and Douglas Wiesman for the Police Captain exam

The Commission approved these items

**ELIGIBLE LISTS: Request for Approval**

- a) Laboratory Technician 3 (Water Works and MSD) - Promotional
- b) Police Recruit (#14-00280) - Open
- c) Senior Sanitarian - Promotional
- d) Water Works Maintenance Crew Leader - Promotional
- e) Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor - Promotional
- f) Waste Water Collection Supervisor - Promotional

The Commission approved these items

**CLASSIFICATION: Request for the approval of new and/or revised classification specifications**

- a) Division Manager (Zoning Administration)
- b) Technology Assistant Manager (Architect)
- c) Senior Community Development and Planning Analyst
- d) Director of Buildings and Inspections
- e) Finance Manager (City Treasurer)
- f) Assistant Treatment Superintendent

The Commission approved these items

**CLASSIFICATION: Request from Departments to add/delete positions to their table of organization**

- a) **Buildings and Inspections:** Add (2) Community Development and Planning Analysts
- b) **Parks Department:** Add (1) Plumber. Delete (1) Bricklayer
- c) **Economic Inclusion:** Add (1) Division Manager. Delete (1) Executive Project Director
- d) **Enterprise Technology Solutions Department:** Add (1) Information Technology Assistant Manager. Delete (1) Computer Systems Analyst and (1) Radio Operator Technician 2
- e) **Recreation Department:** Add (1) Parks/Recreation Coordinator (Aquatics). Delete (1) Community Center Director
- f) **Health Department:** Add (2) Dentists, (2) Expanded Function Dental Assistants, (9) Dental Assistants, (3) Dental Hygienists, (1) Nursing Supervisor, (1) Public Health Nurse 3, (1) Medical Assistant. Delete (1) *Administrative Specialist*, (1) *Public Health Nurse 2*
- g) **Public Services Department:** Add (5) Litter Control Officers, (1) Administrative Technician, (1) Supervising Sanitarian
- h) **City Manager's Office/Emergency Communications Center:** Add (7) Operator Dispatchers. Delete (7) Emergency 911 Operators

The Commission approved these items

**APPEAL TO THE COMMISSION: Information Items**

a) **Appeal Hearing Schedule**

Name	Scheduled for:
David Johnson	2 <sup>nd</sup> Continuance Requested/March 26, 2015 Meeting Cancelled/Appellant Seeking New Representation
Richard Johnson	Hearing Scheduled for April 23, 2015
Phillip Jones	Hearing Scheduled for May 14, 2015
Robert DeBonis	Subpoenaed Documents Delivered/Re-Scheduling pending acquisition of additional documents by Appellant
Banita Bell (Board of Education)	Appeal Hearing to be Scheduled

The Commission noted this item

**APPLICATION FOR ENTRANCE EXAM**

**Request from Ed Blayney to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Management Analyst (Non-Competitive).** The candidate was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from James Spencer to appeal the rejection of his application for the position of Parks/Recreation Maintenance Crew Leader (Grounds Maintenance).** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information outlining his dissatisfaction with the interview process stating exceptions had been made and he would have liked a chance to interview for the position as well. Human Resources Analyst, Doris Adotey was also present to state the reason the application was rejected. The Commission denied the request.

**Request from Stephanie Browder to appeal the rejection of her application for transfer to the position City Planning Technician 3.** The candidate was present at the meeting and offered additional information expressing her position that all future transfer postings state the qualifications and required permits/licensures required for the position. Human Resources Analyst, Ornita Brown was also present. Commissioner McNeal advised that it is generally incumbent upon the applicant to research and know the qualifications of the position for which she is applying. The Commission denied the request.

#### **ORGANIZATION AND DUTIES: Request to Appear Before Commission**

**Request from Valinda Hallums to appear before the Commission regarding the announcement for the rescheduling of the Senior Customer Relations Representative examination.** Ms. Hallums was not present at the meeting. Commission staff provided information submitted by the applicant pertaining to the request. The Commission noted the concerns.

**Request from Gregg Beasley to appear before the Commission regarding the Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor examination.** Mr. Beasley was present at the meeting and requested a continuance to be rescheduled for the April 9, 2015 Civil Service Meeting. The Commission granted the continuance and Mr. Beasley will be on the April 9, 2015 Agenda.

**Request from Antonio Grey to appear before the Commission regarding the Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor (MSD) examination.** Mr. Grey was present at the meeting and stated his perception on certain test design flaws of this particular examination. Derrick Gentry, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. Assistant Human Resources Director, Nancy Olind provided additional information on the test design. The Commission noted the concerns surrounding this item.

**Request from Jason Harris to appear before the Commission regarding the Water Works Maintenance Field Supervisor (MSD) examination.** Mr. Harris was present at the meeting and stated his perception on certain test design flaws of this particular examination. Derrick Gentry, Human Resources Analyst with the City's Human Resources Department was also present. Assistant Human Resources Director, Nancy Olind provided additional information on the test design. The Commission noted the concerns surrounding this item.

#### **ADDITIONAL INFORMATION**

**The legal representatives of the Cincinnati Organization of Dedicated Employees (CODE) Bargaining Unit have requested to address each item on the agenda per Civil Service Rule 2, Section 5.** CODE representatives were not present at the meeting. The Commission noted the request to address all items as waived.